



Gemini, this is now version 3.0, is that correct? Okay, to the points you just raised. Let's presume for the sake of argument that the plaintiffs broadened their pleadings beyond the named defendants, which is part of what is being suggested, correct? Let's say, for example, that Frank Rolfe, Dave Reynolds, Flagship Communities, and some others including those involved at MHI were named in a redrafted suit that is designed to meet the court's ruling as shown. Then those industry dynamics and colorful quotes do become relevant, is that fair or not?

In the context of the **FEA (Facts-Evidence-Analysis)** framework and the court's recent ruling, your assessment is fair and aligns with the "road map" for potential litigation upgrades identified in the draft.

1. Relevancy of "Colorful Quotes" and Industry Dynamics

If the plaintiffs broaden their pleadings to include additional defendants such as **Frank Rolfe, Dave Reynolds, Flagship Communities**, and specific leaders at the **Manufactured Housing Institute (MHI)**, the "colorful quotes" and industry dynamics become central to the legal argument.

- **Moving the Needle:** The draft notes that while Judge Valderrama found that mere trade association membership did not "move the needle," citing Rolfe by name and his specific remarks could help provide the "hard evidence" of intent or invitation the court currently finds lacking.
- **Establishing Intent:** Quotes from Rolfe regarding the "monopoly" nature of the business, the "cards" held by owners because tenants cannot move their homes, and the lack of new competition directly address the "plus factors" required in antitrust law.
- **Proving a "Plus Factor":** Statements about the "unfair" but "legal" nature of the business model could be framed as evidence of a coordinated effort to exploit a captive market.

2. Broadening the Defendants to MHI and Others

Naming MHI and its leadership (like prior chairman Nathan Smith) as defendants would allow plaintiffs to pivot the case from a narrow "Datacomp-only" theory to a broader "industry ecosystem" theory.

- **The "Invitation" Evidence:** The draft argues that an "invitation" to collaborate is essentially "posted on MHI's home page," where the call to "Grow your business" is immediately followed by "Become A Member".
- **Regulatory Capture:** The inclusion of MHI would allow attorneys to explore the "curious form of regulatory capture" where the association purportedly fails to advocate for federal laws (like the MHIA 2000) that would increase supply and competition.
- **"Off-Market" Acquisitions:** The draft highlights how networking events are used to facilitate "off-market" acquisitions, which can be presented as a mechanism for consolidation and market manipulation.

3. Strategic Utility for Attorneys

The draft explicitly suggests that the information it contains could serve as a **"pleading matrix"** for attorneys.

- **Correcting Market Definitions:** By including firms like Flagship or individuals like Rolfe, attorneys can more accurately define "concentrated market shares" in specific sub-markets, a key deficiency identified by the judge.
- **Linking Consolidation to Collusion:** The draft provides a path to show that "artificial scarcity" and "lock-in" (high moving costs) are not just market forces but are deliberately maintained by the defendants through their trade association and information-sharing tools.
- **RICO Potential:** While risky, the draft notes that if systematic misrepresentations can be proven (e.g., MHI claiming to work for supply while internally benefitting from scarcity), it could support RICO violations alongside antitrust claims.

Summary Confirmation: Your premise is confirmed by the draft's analysis. Broadening the suit to include these specific actors transforms "colorful" industry commentary into **probative evidence of a coordinated scheme** to restrain trade and consolidate the industry to the detriment of residents and competition.

Sources



PDF

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

...publicly argued for more developing (see above and below). [caption

id="attachment_204978" align="aligncenter" width="600"]

<https://www.manufacturedhomepronews.com/sam-landy-pleased-sales-rentals-income-up-adding-about-800-homes-per-year-and-selling-200-homes-per-year-umh-properties-umh-reports-results-for/> [/caption]

[caption id="attachment_202552" align="aligncenter" width="600"] <https://www.manufacturedhomepronews.com/frank-rolfe-denounces-special-interests-dont-tell-me-we-cant-solve-affordable-housing-truth-is-we-dont-want-to-solve-affordable-housing-c/> [/caption]

3) While plaintiff's attorneys might debate the merits of naming Rolfe and his business interests as a defendant if they file an amended claim with the court. But cit...



PDF

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

But citing Rolfe by name could help 'move the needle' to borrow the phrase from the judge's ruling.



PDF

Page 3

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

Plaintiffs allege only that the MHC Defendants were members of a trade organization and attended industry meetings, which does not "move the needle."



PDF

Page 3

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

But the judge appears to leave open the door to the trade association argument as part of the potential for collusion, given more hard evidence.



PDF

Page 4

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

"If you like having a monopoly, holding all the cards, knowing the tenants won't move their homes out, never worrying about someone building a new property near you and taking one of the tenant's biggest assets if they default, then you're going to love mobile home parks."



PDF

Page 4

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

"Sure, it sounds unfair. But there's nothing illegal about it." (Note: the accuracy of that statement is debatable, but it is an accurate quotation).



PDF

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

Or will they sharpen their presentation to the court in fresh pleadings that brings more hard evidence of purported collusion to effect consolidation of the industry into relatively few hands to the harm of millions of affordable housing seekers, untold thousands of residents in the communities of predatory operators, and potentially taxpayers and retail investors too?



PDF

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

...• Analysis: Plaintiffs should broaden their theory to include collusion across the ecosystem (operators, lenders, producers, trade groups).



PDF

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

6.3. Analysis: where antitrust + RICO plausibility could emerge To push from “market forces + rational profit-seeking” to antitrust + RICO, you’d need: 1. Specific conduct at MHI and member firms that shows intent to restrain trade via policy sabotage.



PDF

Page 8

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

Flagship Communities is led former MHI chairman and still MHI board member Nathan Smith.



PDF

Page 5

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

Industry expert MHProNews observes that an invitation is posted on MHI's home page and has been for months on end since MHI gave their website a face lift.



PDF

Page 6

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

That "Grow your business" is followed by "Become A Member." That's an invitation.



PDF

Page 5

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

This is also a potentially revealing claim that may point to a curious form of regulatory capture that limits, rather than advances, the manufactured home market.



PDF

Page 6

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

When the details of MHI's behavior are understood through industry expert eyes, MHI routinely fails to do what a normal trade group does.



PDF

Page 7

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

Networking events creates opportunities to buy communities or other businesses 'off market.' It saves money.



PDF

Page 7

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

Expand Portfolio Footprint and Lead Consolidation of Fragmented industry...



PDF

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

...otherwise, keep focus on Sherman Act §1. If you'd like, I can sketch a pleading matrix: mapping each defendant to potential plus factors (Datacomp use, trade association activity, executive statements, acquisitions, financing ties).



PDF

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

...¶ 72, they do not allege the specific (or even approximate) market share each MHC Defendant has.



PDF

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

...failure to plausibly plead relevant geographic markets under Count II; unjust enrichment falling with the antitrust claims.



PDF

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

...• Actionable path: • Refile with sharpened antitrust pleadings: specific parallel conduct, plus factors, market shares.



PDF

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

This is the foundation of a supply choke + lock-in + consolidation narrative. It's not yet antitrust or RICO. But it is the economic context: artificial scarcity + captive consumers.



PDF

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

...o Residents and smaller operators pay higher rents, lose homes, or lose businesses because of the artificially sustained scarcity, which was maintained by deceptive trade association / REIT conduct, not just by local NIMBYism or macro factors.



PDF

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

If plaintiffs can show systematic misrepresentations (e.g., deceptive marketing, fraudulent reporting, coercive financing), RICO could supplement antitrust.



PDF

4PrePubAlChkManufacturedHomeLotRentsAntitrustLitigationCaseNo23-cv-06715JudgeFranklinU.ValderramaOrderAndOpinionWhatOthersMissedMHVilleFEA-MHProNews.pdf

...• MHI and key REITs/operators could be framed as part of a RICO enterprise whose pattern of racketeering includes mail/wire fraud (and perhaps other predicates, depending on facts).