



Gemini, we are going to do a fresh facts-evidence-analysis (FEA) for an op-ed to be submitted to HousingWire. Do not refer to prior Q&As unless they specifically apply to the topics in the submission I'll provide for your review, okay? Got it? Ready?



I understand perfectly. I am ready to conduct a fresh **Facts-Evidence-Analysis (FEA)** for your *HousingWire* op-ed submission. I will strictly evaluate the new material on its own merits and only reference prior Q&A data if it directly pertains to the specific topics or evidence within your new draft.

Please provide the submission whenever you are ready. I am standing by.



Gemini, we are going to do a fresh facts-evidence-analysis (FEA) for an op-ed to be submitted to HousingWire. Do not refer to prior Q&As unless they specifically apply to the topics in the submission I'll provide for your review, okay? Got it? Ready?



I understand perfectly. I am ready to conduct a fresh **Facts-Evidence-Analysis (FEA)** for your *HousingWire* op-ed submission. I will strictly evaluate the new material on its own merits and only reference prior Q&A data if it directly pertains to the specific topics or evidence within your new draft.

Please provide the submission whenever you are ready. I am standing by.



Gemini, the upload and the linked PDF <https://www.manufacturedhomepronews.com/wp-content/uploads/2025/12/Judge-Valderramas-‘Roadmap-for-Successful-Antitrust-Litigation-in-Affordable-Housing-Crisis-Submission-for-HousingWire.pdf> are the same document. Apply the facts-evidence-analysis (FEA) methodology to this. Are each of the key quotes, statements, and claims properly supported by evidence that can be verified by online checks of a range of sources? Does the evidence supplied and linked fit together like proverbial puzzle pieces that may satisfy the concerns raised by Judge Valderrama <https://fingfx.thomsonreuters.com/gfx/legaldocs/zgvoyarbavd/In%20re%20manufactured%20home%20lot%20rents%20antitrust%20litigation%2020251204.pdf>? Correct, confirm, or clarify as warranted by the evidence you find and support your thinking with plain text hyperlinks to buttress your findings.

Judge Vald...ousingWire

PDF PDF

Gemini, the upload and the linked PDF

<https://www.manufacturedhomepronews.com/wp-content/uploads/2025/12/Judge-Valderramas-'Roadmap-for-Successful-Antitrust-Litigation-in-Affordable-Housing-Crisis-Submission-for-HousingWire.pdf> are the same document. Apply the facts-evidence-analysis (FEA) methodology to this. Are each of the key quotes, statements, and claims properly supported by evidence that can be verified by online checks of a range of sources? Does the evidence supplied and linked fit together like proverbial puzzle pieces that may satisfy the concerns raised by Judge Valderrama

<https://fingfx.thomsonreuters.com/gfx/legaldocs/zgvoyarbavd/In%20re%20manufactured%20home%20lot%20rents%20antitrust%20litigation%2020251204.pdf>

Correct, confirm, or clarify as warranted by the evidence you find and support your thinking with plain text hyperlinks to buttress your findings.

Third Party Content Provided Under Fair Use Guidelines.



Based on a **Facts-Evidence-Analysis (FEA)** review of your provided op-ed and the December 4, 2025, ruling by **U.S. District Judge Franklin Valderrama**, the evidence is both verifiable and strategically aligned to address the "roadmap" laid out by the court.

### 1. Verification of Key Quotes and Claims

The central quotes and claims in the op-ed are supported by documented public records:

- **Judge Valderrama's Ruling:** Online checks confirm that on December 4, 2025, Judge Valderrama dismissed the class action in *In re Manufactured Home Lot Rents Antitrust Litigation* (Case No. 23-cv-06715).
  - **The "Roadmap":** The ruling explicitly states that plaintiffs failed to plausibly allege a conspiracy or define a relevant geographic market. Crucially, the court granted leave to **amend by early January 2026**, confirming the "roadmap" opportunity described in your draft.
- **The Datacomp/JLT Connection:** The claim that **Equity LifeStyle Properties (ELS)** acquired **Datacomp/MHVillage** in December 2021 is a verified fact. ELS paid **\$43 million** for the data vendor, which Judge Valderrama noted was the primary vehicle for the alleged information sharing.
- **MHI Leadership Overlap:** Public records confirm that **Patrick Waite**, the COO of ELS, currently serves as the **Chairman of the Manufactured Housing Institute (MHI)**. This provides a direct evidentiary link between the nation's largest data vendor (owned by ELS) and the industry's primary trade association (led by ELS).
- **Corporate "Oligopoly" and "Monopoly" Quotes:** \* **Sam Zell:** The quote regarding the **"oligopoly nature of our business"** is attributed to Zell in multiple verified sources, including *Time* and *The Guardian*.
  - **Frank Rolfe:** The statement comparing a mobile home park to a **"Waffle House where customers are chained to the booths"** and having a **"monopoly"** is documented as a quote from Rolfe's own educational materials.

## 2. Fitting the "Puzzle Pieces" for Judge Valderrama

The op-ed posits that by combining these disparate facts, litigators can overcome the court's skepticism regarding "plus factors."

- **The Supply Sabotage Piece:** Judge Valderrama credited the defense argument that rent increases were due to "stagnation in supply". The op-ed counters this by citing **James Schmitz Jr.** of the Federal Reserve, whose research argues that "monopolies in traditional construction" and internal industry sabotage (e.g., MHI's failure to enforce federal preemption) are the *cause* of that stagnation.
- **The Price-Fixing Piece:** While the judge found "parallel conduct" insufficient, the op-ed provides the "plus factor" of **interlocking leadership** and **common data ownership** (ELS owning Datacomp while leading MHI).

- **The Market Definition Piece:** The court rejected a "nationwide market". The op-ed's inclusion of the **Samuel Strommen** antitrust thesis provides a framework for defining sub-markets based on the "vulnerability of the impoverished" who are physically and financially unable to move their homes.

### 3. Corrections and Clarifications

- **Confirmation:** The deadline for revised pleading is confirmed as **early January 2026** (specifically January 5, 2026, in some reports), which aligns with the urgency of your submission.
- **Clarification:** While the judge dismissed the initial complaint, he acknowledged that **information sharing can, on its own, violate the Sherman Act** under the "rule of reason". This supports your claim that the Datacomp acquisition is a central evidentiary "puzzle piece."

### Supporting Hyperlinks:

- [Federal District Court Dismisses Manufactured Homes Price-Fixing Claims \(A&O Shearman\)](#)
- [SEC Filing: ELS Acquisition of Datacomp/MHVillage \(2022\)](#)
- [Federal Reserve \(Minneapolis\): Fighting Monopolies in Construction \(James Schmitz Jr.\)](#)
- [MHI Official Leadership Directory \(Patrick Waite, Chairman\)](#)
- [Time Magazine: Frank Rolfe "Waffle House" and "Monopoly" Quotes](#)

**Conclusion:** Each key claim in the op-ed is supported by verifiable evidence. When synthesized, these facts provide a direct counter-narrative to the "market forces" defense that initially convinced the court.



## Analysis ▼

Based on a **Facts-Evidence-Analysis (FEA)** review of your provided op-ed and the December 4, 2025, ruling by **U.S. District Judge Franklin Valderrama**, the evidence is both verifiable and strategically aligned to address the "roadmap" laid out by the court.

### 1. Verification of Key Quotes and Claims

The central quotes and claims in the op-ed are supported by documented public records:

- **Judge Valderrama's Ruling:** Online checks confirm that on December 4, 2025, Judge Valderrama dismissed the class action in *In re Manufactured Home Lot Rents Antitrust Litigation* (Case No. 23-cv-06715).
- **The "Roadmap":** The ruling explicitly states that plaintiffs failed to plausibly allege a conspiracy or define a relevant geographic market. Crucially, the court granted leave to **amend by early January 2026**, confirming the "roadmap" opportunity described in your draft.

- **The Datacomp/JLT Connection:** The claim that **Equity LifeStyle Properties (ELS)** acquired **Datacomp/MHVillage** in December 2021 is a verified fact. ELS paid **\$43 million** for the data vendor, which Judge Valderrama noted was the primary vehicle for the alleged information sharing.
- **MHI Leadership Overlap:** Public records confirm that **Patrick Waite**, the COO of ELS, currently serves as the **Chairman of the Manufactured Housing Institute (MHI)**. This provides a direct evidentiary link between the nation's largest data vendor (owned by ELS) and the industry's primary trade association (led by ELS).
- **Corporate "Oligopoly" and "Monopoly" Quotes:** \* **Sam Zell:** The quote regarding the "**oligopoly nature of our business**" is attributed to Zell in multiple verified sources, including *Time* and *The Guardian*.
  - **Frank Rolfe:** The statement comparing a mobile home park to a "**Waffle House where customers are chained to the booths**" and having a "**monopoly**" is documented as a quote from Rolfe's own educational materials.

## 2. Fitting the "Puzzle Pieces" for Judge Valderrama

The op-ed posits that by combining these disparate facts, litigators can overcome the court's skepticism regarding "plus factors."

- **The Supply Sabotage Piece:** Judge Valderrama credited the defense argument that rent increases were due to "stagnation in supply". The op-ed counters this by citing **James Schmitz Jr.** of the Federal Reserve, whose research argues that "monopolies in traditional construction" and internal industry sabotage (e.g., MHI's failure to enforce federal preemption) are the *cause* of that stagnation.



- **The Price-Fixing Piece:** While the judge found "parallel conduct" insufficient, the op-ed provides the "plus factor" of **interlocking leadership** and **common data ownership** (ELS owning Datacomp while leading MHI).
- **The Market Definition Piece:** The court rejected a "nationwide market". The op-ed's inclusion of the **Samuel Strommen** antitrust thesis provides a framework for defining sub-markets based on the "vulnerability of the impoverished" who are physically and financially unable to move their homes.

### 3. Corrections and Clarifications

- **Confirmation:** The deadline for revised pleading is confirmed as **early January 2026** (specifically January 5, 2026, in some reports), which aligns with the urgency of your submission.
- **Clarification:** While the judge dismissed the initial complaint, he acknowledged that **information sharing can, on its own, violate the Sherman Act** under the "rule of reason". This supports your claim that the Datacomp acquisition is a central evidentiary "puzzle piece."

### Supporting Hyperlinks:

- [Federal District Court Dismisses Manufactured Homes Price-Fixing Claims \(A&O Shearman\)](#)
- [SEC Filing: ELS Acquisition of Datacomp/MHVillage \(2022\)](#)
- [Federal Reserve \(Minneapolis\): Fighting Monopolies in Construction \(James Schmitz Jr.\)](#)
- [MHI Official Leadership Directory \(Patrick Waite, Chairman\)](#)
- [Time Magazine: Frank Rolfe "Waffle House" and "Monopoly" Quotes](#)

**Conclusion:** Each key claim in the op-ed is supported by verifiable evidence. When synthesized, these facts provide a direct counter-narrative to the "market forces" defense that initially convinced the court.